

people place heritage

CONTEXT

Statement of Evidence
9 BRIDGE ROAD BARWON HEADS

Amendment C354
City of Greater Geelong

23 February 2017

Prepared for
City of Greater Geelong



© Context Pty Ltd 2017

Project Team:

Louise Honman

Report Register

This report register documents the development and issue of the report entitled *Statement of Evidence 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads*, undertaken by Louise Honman of Context Pty Ltd in accordance with our internal quality management system.

Project No.	Issue No.	Notes/description	Issue Date	Issued to
2198	1	Draft report	20/2/2017	Peter Smith
2198	2	Final report	23/2/2017	Peter Smith

Context Pty Ltd

22 Merri Street, Brunswick VIC 3056

Phone 03 9380 6933

Facsimile 03 9380 4066

Email context@contextpl.com.au

Web www.contextpl.com.au

CONTENTS

1.0	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Purpose	1
1.2	Background	1
1.3	Instructions	1
1.4	Reports relied upon	1
1.5	Relevant expertise	2
1.6	Qualifications and experience	2
1.7	Declaration	2
2.0	METHODOLOGY	3
2.1	Introduction	3
2.2	Peer review	3
2.3	Establishing heritage value	3
	Historic value	4
	Representativeness	4
	Aesthetic value	5
	Significance threshold	5
	Applying tree controls	5
2.4	Other matters	6
	Integrity, intactness and condition	6
3.0	RESPONSE TO SUBMISSIONS	7
3.1	Introduction	7
3.2	Supporting submissions	7
	Particular issues submissions 29 and 64	8
3.3	Objecting submissions	9
	Submission 26	9
4.0	CONCLUSION	16
	REFERENCES	17
	APPENDIX 1	18
	Draft statement of significance	18

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Purpose

The purpose of the Statement of Evidence is to assist the Planning Panel convened to consider Amendment C354 that seeks to apply permanent heritage controls to 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads. I have prepared this statement of evidence for the City of Greater Geelong.

I, Louise Honman have prepared this statement of evidence based on the Context Pty Ltd Heritage Report, 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads, 2016; and I accept that document as my own.

1.2 Background

Context Pty Ltd was engaged by the City of Greater Geelong in May 2016 in relation to the application of interim heritage controls on 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads.

The City sought a peer review of the *9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads Heritage Values Review* prepared by RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants (RBA Report). The peer review is the *Heritage Report 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads* (Context Report).

1.3 Instructions

My instructions from the City of Geelong in relation to Amendment C354 are as follows:

1. Meet with Peter Smith as Council's representative
2. Inspect the site and surrounds of 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads
3. Review the RBA and Context heritage assessments, amendment material, relevant background documents and key submissions.
4. Provide my opinion on the amendment particularly as they relate to my expertise in heritage matters.
5. Prepare an expert witness report in accordance with the Planning Panels Victoria expert evidence guidelines and in particular having regard to:
 - o 5.1 Whether or not the Amendment addresses the VPP Practice Note: *Applying the Heritage Overlay*
 - o 5.2 any other heritage matters which I consider arise from the Amendment documentation and background material
 - o 5.3 the matters raised in submissions to the amendment as they relate to heritage.
6. Review other heritage expert witness reports prepared on behalf of other parties
7. Present evidence at the Panel Hearing on 3 March 2017

1.4 Reports relied upon

In preparing this Statement of Evidence the following reports and documents have been relied upon:

Context Pty Ltd, 2016 *Heritage Report, 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads*, prepared for the City of Greater Geelong

RBA Architects + Conservation Consultants, 2016, *9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads Heritage Values Review* prepared for the Barwon Heads Association

Authentic Heritage Services, 2000, *City of Greater Geelong Outer Areas Heritage Study Stage 2*, vols 2 & 4.

My role in the preparation of the Context Report was to supervise Context employee and heritage consultant Giselle Harris in carrying out the work. I instructed her, assisted in the structure of the report, reviewed the content and findings and signed off on the report.

1.5 Relevant expertise

My area of expertise relevant to this Panel is in the assessment of cultural heritage significance of buildings and places; with reference to the current heritage assessment criteria, and within the framework of historic themes.

I have been retained by a number of Councils in relation to heritage matters and the assessment of cultural heritage significance. I have also been retained as an expert witness for Amendments relating to the heritage of places including City of Yarra C173, Rural City of Mildura C79, Mitchell Shire C56, Shire of Golden Plains C55, Surfcoast Shire C50, City of Boroondara C99, City of Greater Geelong C196, and Shire of Whittlesea C153. I was also retained by the Newtown Action Group in respect of City of Greater Geelong C300.

I have undertaken assessments of heritage places for a range of metropolitan and regional heritage studies and my work as a heritage consultant involves advising clients on built heritage and heritage planning for places of cultural significance.

1.6 Qualifications and experience

Bachelor of Architecture (Hons.) (Deakin University)

Registered Architect, ARBV

Member – ICOMOS Australia

Member – Australian Institute of Architects

I am a registered architect with over thirty years' experience specialising in heritage and conservation projects. I have extensive experience in heritage assessment, preparation of conservation management plans, principles of building conservation, architectural design and heritage advisory roles within local government. I am a member of the Victorian Heritage Council and the Heritage Committee of the Australian Institute of Architects.

Prior to joining the Context team, I worked in Historic Buildings Branch of the Public Works Department, at Deakin University, and previously in private practice with Meredith Gould Architect and Nigel Lewis and Associates. Past local government experience has included heritage adviser roles with councils at Queenscliff, Moyne and Glenelg in regional Victoria.

I have had extensive experience in preparing Conservation Management Plans for individual buildings and complex sites. Examples include Treasury Reserve Melbourne and Government House (with Trethewan Architecture), Lake Tyers Aboriginal Mission and O'Shannassy Silvan Water Supply System. I have completed Heritage Management Plans for several courthouses including Thursday Island, Geraldton, Portland and Launceston.

Since joining Context in early 2008 I have managed numerous heritage studies including those for Bendigo City Centre (2016), White Hills and East Bendigo (2016), the former Shire of Walpeup (2014), Mornington Peninsula (2012) and Banyule (2009). I am employed as heritage adviser to the Shire of Mount Alexander from 2012- present time.

1.7 Declaration

'I have made all the inquiries that I believe are desirable and appropriate and no matters of significance which I regard as relevant have to my knowledge been withheld from the Panel.'



2.0 METHODOLOGY

2.1 Introduction

I have prepared this statement of evidence to provide expert opinion on the following questions:

- Does the Amendment C354 address the VPP Practice Note: *Applying the Heritage Overlay*?
- Are there any other heritage matters which arise from the Amendment documentation and background material?

This section outlines Context involvement through the peer review process and the standard approach to establishing heritage significance through the application of criteria and thresholds. Each criterion applicable to 9 Bridge Road is discussed separately. This section also includes a discussion of integrity, condition and intactness as contributing factors in the assessment of cultural heritage significance.

2.2 Peer review

In undertaking a peer review of the RBA Report Context:

- Reviewed the evidence on which the RBA Report was based
- Advised on the methodology used
- Undertook a site visit
- Undertook some further documentary research and comparative analysis
- Provided a draft statement of significance

The Context Report agreed with the conclusion reached in the RBA Report that 9 Bridge Road is of local heritage significance. Furthermore, it noted that the RBA Report provided a sound basis for the preparation of a statement of significance.

Whilst the RBA Report had identified key aspects of significance of 9 Bridge Road, some additional supporting information was provided by Context and a draft statement of significance was prepared.

The Context Report was reviewed by the City's heritage adviser David Rowe and some small edits were made plus additional information on architect A.J. Derrick provided.

2.3 Establishing heritage value

The Heritage Overlay may be applied to places of cultural heritage significance following an assessment process. The act of determining whether a place is of cultural heritage significance is sometimes criticised as being a subjective exercise. Views on cultural heritage significance can vary between individuals and also evolve over time. This variability reflects personal experience, values and history.

However, the process of assessing cultural heritage significance is a rigorous and objective one that is guided by the principles of *The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance* (2013) and has been developed and refined over many years of heritage practice in Victoria and Australia more broadly.

This section refers to the standard approach for the assessment of places of cultural heritage value and comments on the assessment undertaken for 9 Bridge Road. Places to be included on the Heritage Overlay need to demonstrate their significance as a basis for inclusion.

The draft statement of significance for 9 Bridge Road indicates that it has historic, representative and aesthetic heritage values.

Criteria for assessment of cultural significance (VHR-HV 2008)	
(a)	Importance to the course, or pattern, of Victoria's cultural history.
(b)	Possession of uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of Victoria's cultural history.
(c)	Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of Victoria's cultural history.
(d)	Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects.
(e)	Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics.
(f)	Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period.
(g)	Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions.
(h)	Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in Victoria's history.

Historic value

Historic value is importance to the course of pattern of cultural or natural history. (Criterion a)

The place needs to have a clear association with an event, phase, period, or way of life in Greater Geelong's cultural history. The association of the place needs to be evident in the physical fabric and/or in documentary resources or oral history (HC-VHR, 2014:5).

For 9 Bridge Road there are both physical attributes and intangible elements that demonstrate its historic value including:

Tangible attributes:

- Building setting, form and elements that demonstrate its connection to important themes for Barwon Heads
- Evidence of its evolution from the 1930s and 40s in photographs and in the building
- Key historical location on the corner of Hitchcock Avenue, the commercial street; and Bridge Road, formerly the main road from Geelong.
- Early date of construction relative to Barwon Heads' development. In 1891 Barwon Heads was a fledgling community where buildings numbered few and the houses just sixteen. (Rowe, 2000:15)

Intangible attributes:

- Consistency with historic themes (township development, holiday homes, leisure and beaches)
- Longevity of ownership within the one family
- Association with a person/people of some interest in the Geelong and Bellarine regions.

Representativeness

Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural places and objects (Criterion d)

The class of places has a clear association with an event, phase, period, process, function, movement, custom or way of life in a locality's history. The event, phase etc. is of historical importance to the locality and the principal characteristics of the class are evident in the physical fabric of the place.

A class is defined as a *sub-category* of a broad place type, such as schools, railway stations, houses etc. A class is generally defined by a specific purpose or use, era, design characteristic, construction technique, materials used or some other recognisable quality. A class should provide a useful basis for comparison and be readily discernible.

For 9 Bridge Road the class is “Victorian (pre 1900) residences in Barwon Heads”

9 Bridge Road is an example of the class of places demonstrating:

- Victorian residential architecture
- A holiday house expressing the evolution and modifications common to many other residences in Barwon Heads
- An example of the work of architect A.J. Derrick whose local churches on the Bellarine Peninsula are notable and on the Heritage Overlay.

Aesthetic value

Importance in exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics (Criterion e)

Aesthetic characteristics are the visual qualities of a place or object that invite judgement against the ideals of beauty, picturesqueness, evocativeness, expressiveness, grotesqueness, sublimeness and other descriptors of aesthetic judgement. The visual or other sensory qualities of a place or object lie in its form, scale, setting, unity, contrast, colour, texture and material or ‘fabric’ (HC-VHR, 2014:13).

For 9 Bridge Road aesthetic value is expressed in the physical attributes of the place including:

- The prominent siting of the house and cypress tree on a rise at the end of Hitchcock Avenue
- The cypress tree as part of the setting
- The house with its double gabled roof form and timber construction dating to c.1910, decorative gable end strapping and surviving chimney from the 1890s

Significance threshold

The ***significance threshold*** determines the level of cultural heritage significance a place or object has and what mechanisms can therefore be used to protect and manage it. The significance threshold can be defined as:

A place that is of heritage value to a ***locality or municipality*** has the potential to be recognised as being of ***local*** cultural heritage significance (and may be included in the Heritage Overlay of the local planning scheme);

The ***local*** threshold is the minimum level of cultural heritage significance that a place or object must possess to justify its inclusion on the Heritage Overlay (HC-VHR, 2014:3).

For 9 Bridge Road the consideration is whether the place is of local heritage significance. No other level of heritage significance is assumed to apply.

Applying tree controls

Tree controls can be applied to a site that contribute to the significance of the heritage place. The cypress tree (*Cupressus Macrocarpa*) is a landmark tree and contributes to the setting of 9 Bridge Road. Its value lies in its connection to the Thomas family and its contribution to the setting of the house and the immediate neighbourhood, especially viewed from Hitchcock Avenue. Tree controls are considered to be appropriate.

2.4 Other matters

Integrity, intactness and condition

The terms integrity, intactness and condition have subtly different meanings in cultural heritage assessment, and the terminology used needs to be precise.

Integrity refers to the degree to which the heritage values of the place are still evident and can be understood and appreciated. If considerable change to a place or object has occurred (through encroaching development, changes to the fabric, physical deterioration of the fabric etc.) the heritage values may not be readily identifiable, and the place or object may have low-level integrity.

Integrity is important in assessing heritage value. The degree to which a place has been altered and the design or building material (fabric) removed is an important matter for consideration when assessing heritage value. The extent to which alterations tend to exclude a place from the Heritage Overlay is open to interpretation and may depend on several factors including:

- Extent and nature of the alterations
- The ability to ‘read’ the place despite the alterations
- Relative integrity compared with other ‘like’ places in the same locality
- Other heritage values still evident (historic, associational, social)

Intactness refers to the degree to which a place or object retains its significant fabric. Condition refers to the fitness for purpose or deterioration of fabric. Intactness is different to condition as a place may be highly intact but the fabric may be in a very fragile condition. Condition and intactness are not generally taken into consideration in the establishment of significance as they have little influence in the assessment of heritage value.

9 Bridge Road

9 Bridge Road is in good condition and appears to be well maintained. It has a reasonably high degree of integrity since its heritage values are still evident and can be understood and appreciated. Significant fabric is still retained in the house and garden despite the changes that have occurred. Intactness at various times is well documented in photographs and key changes c1910, 1930s, 1940s each provide an individual snapshot of the place in time.

Intactness is relative to a particular time and for 9 Bridge Road its period of significance could be defined as ‘the Thomas period of ownership from 1901-1990’. In this case all of the changes within this time frame may form part of its significance. Authenticity to an original design may be of lesser value than the evolutionary changes under the Thomas custodianship.

When other ‘like’ places in Barwon Heads are examined they are found to also contain replaced elements to a greater or lesser degree, resulting in a similar level of intactness.

3.0 RESPONSE TO SUBMISSIONS

3.1 Introduction

Amendment C534 received 76 submissions - one objecting, three neutral and 72 submissions in support of the Amendment. The many points raised by submitters supporting the Amendment are noted in four key themes. Particular responses are provided to submissions 2, 29 and 64 which provide a more detailed outlining of the issues.

The broad themes drawn from supporting submissions include:

- Preserving the cultural identity of Barwon Heads
- Part of a declining group of early Barwon Heads places
- Location and sense of place
- Individual aesthetic and historic significance

3.2 Supporting submissions

Preserving the cultural identity of Barwon Heads

These submissions are about the contribution that 9 Bridge Road makes within the context of Barwon Heads through its siting, location and historic character.

- *Prominent and significant part of the cultural identity of Barwon Heads*
- *Preserve Barwon Heads' point of difference*
- *A house loved by locals*
- *Important to retain icons that are part of the town attractions*
- *Preserving cultural identity enriches communities*
- *Preservation of the building helps maintain the character and charm of the town.*
- *Retention will help convey the seaside feel*
- *Exhibits true character of Barwon Heads*
- *Significant to Barwon Heads*

Comment

This theme places 9 Bridge Road within a context as part of the fabric of Barwon Heads. It indicates a contribution to retaining the cultural identity of the town as an historic place. 9 Bridge Road is part of the identity of Barwon Heads that appears to be highly valued.

Part of a declining group of early Barwon Heads places

This is about the places that represent part of the earliest development pattern and their perceived loss and increasing rarity.

- *Few historic buildings left in Barwon Heads*
- *9 Bridge Road part of the first wave of development in Barwon Heads*
- *One of the last cottages remaining that give Barwon Heads its character*
- *Built 5 years after the original subdivision of Barwon Heads*
- *One of the oldest buildings in Barwon Heads*
- *House and tree are last remnants of iconic cypress avenue that lined Hitchcock Avenue in the 19th and 20th centuries.*

- *Cypress trees, once part of the character of Barwon Heads are now almost all gone.*

Comment

Documentary research on 9 Bridge Road has established it as an early house in the context of Barwon Heads. Nineteenth century places are not particularly rare (a number are on the HO or identified in the *Greater Geelong Outer Areas Heritage Study*), however that they are scattered throughout a number of streets. Even where there is a precinct Heritage Overlay, they are not necessarily concentrated together. The perception that there has been considerable loss of nineteenth century character is particularly strong for Hitchcock Avenue. The cypress tree at 9 Bridge Road is also perceived as a link with the former cypress avenue.

It is not considered that 9 Bridge Road meets the Criterion B for rarity given that it is one of at least sixteen nineteenth century houses in Barwon Heads on the Heritage Overlay, and others that currently have no statutory protection.

Location and sense of place

This refers to the landmark quality of the house and cypress tree at 9 Bridge Road.

- *House and tree are landmarks*
- *House and tree watch over the town*
- *First thing people see as they drive in to Hitchcock Avenue.*
- *Situated at the southern end of the shopping strip and visually important to the arterial road.*
- *Site is important*
- *Sense of place created by this house*

Comment

These characteristics are expressed through the siting on a high point, its corner location and as a focus at the end of Hitchcock Avenue. The draft statement of significance prepared for 9 Bridge Road includes the siting and landmark qualities under Criterion E.

Individual aesthetic and historic significance

This refers the qualities or attributes of the place itself, the setting, house and the cypress tree as particular elements.

- *9 Bridge Road is an outstanding example of some of the larger timber homes in the area.*
- *130 years old – historic value*
- *House has historic value*
- *House of architectural significance*
- *Internal configuration largely unchanged.*

Comment

The documentary and physical evidence gathered does indicate that 9 Bridge Road does have historic and aesthetic values and the draft statement of significance outlines this evidence. The local threshold is achieved through benchmarking against like places, particularly those on the HO. It is considered that 9 Bridge Road demonstrates those values to a similar degree.

Particular issues submissions 29 and 64

Submission 29 outlines in more detail the history and ownership details of 9 Bridge Road. The first land purchasers (A.J.Derrick and J.Dawson) and how they were contributors to local Geelong and Bellarine Peninsula history. Derrick does have a strong association with the local area through his architectural design work for the Wesleyan parishes of the Bellarine Peninsula. The 90 years of ownership in the Thomas family corresponds to the evolution of the place throughout the 1930s and beyond. Length of association with a particular family is of




consideration in the assessment of historic value and that of the Thomas family is of very long duration.

Submission 64 notes (amongst other things) that 9 Bridge Road is the “oldest complete structure in Barwon Heads”. It is not necessary to be the oldest to qualify for a Heritage Overlay and the property is more accurately portrayed as one of the early residences. It is noted that the internal plan is largely unchanged despite the changes documented to the exterior.



3.3 Objecting submissions

Submission 26



A particular response is provided to submission no.26



Grounds for objection	Comment
<p>Integrity of the building has been compromised by the alterations taken place in the 1930s and the building does not represent an example of 19th century architecture.</p>	<p>The building alterations are well documented in photographs from the 1890s to the 1950s and the evolution of the house can be ascertained.</p>  <p>c.1895 – Significance of this photo is as one of two photos so far discovered that show the original form before the addition of the second gable. Central chimney and roof form and gable end strapping still exists.</p>  <p>c.1900 showing house with original form, detailing and colour scheme. Useful photo as the benchmark from which to understand subsequent changes.</p>  <p>C1930 – this photo is the earliest to show the left hand gable added and the relocated front door from the centre to the left. The roof form is the same today. The verandah fretwork design is clear for the first time, although this may have been altered.</p>

Grounds for objection	Comment
	<div data-bbox="582 304 1353 712" data-label="Image"> </div> <div data-bbox="582 719 1353 808" data-label="Caption"> <p>c.1939. This photo shows the alteration and extension to the verandah, have enclosing with weatherboards and flywire. This form is essentially the same today.</p> </div> <div data-bbox="582 853 1353 1234" data-label="Image"> </div> <div data-bbox="582 1240 1353 1391" data-label="Caption"> <p>c.1940s. This photo is important as it shows the cypress tree in the garden and another in the road reserve. Cypress trees were a feature of Barwon Heads until the 1980s when many were removed. The windows have been replaced with wider ones of a different design. These are identical to the existing windows today.</p> </div> <div data-bbox="582 1435 1318 1749" data-label="Image"> </div> <div data-bbox="582 1756 1353 1794" data-label="Caption"> <p>1955 The verandah has been partially glazed to form an additional room.</p> </div>

Grounds for objection	Comment
	 <p data-bbox="679 719 1422 808">2017 The porch retains some of the 1939 construction in posts, curved fretwork and layout of windows. Internally more of the 1939 windows and weatherboards below are visible.</p>  <p data-bbox="679 1211 1449 1335">The main form of the house and gable end strapping is from c 1890 - c1910, the central chimney from 1890. The porch retains elements from 1939 and the front windows from c.1940. Doors and the deck are contemporary alterations.</p>  <p data-bbox="679 1928 1449 1995">Aerial photo showing the roof form today which corresponds to that of 1939 apart from the rear extension. Source: City of Greater Geelong</p>

Grounds for objection	Comment
	<p data-bbox="584 271 1209 297">Other nineteenth century buildings on the Heritage Overlay.</p>  <p data-bbox="584 772 1278 831">31 Ozone Road –1890,1018-19, (HO1695) alterations include large contemporary two storey wing at rear</p>  <p data-bbox="584 1292 1278 1350">33 Grove Road, 1900, 1943, 1973, (HO1679) restored and replaced elements and large contemporary single storey extension</p>  <p data-bbox="584 1818 1342 1906">57 Seaview Parade, 1885, 1925 (HO1702) hybrid building featuring 1920s pillars on an earlier verandah. House has many replaced elements including windows</p> <p data-bbox="584 1955 1331 2013">These three buildings are amongst many that exhibit changes from their original layout and design and replacement of building fabric, indicating</p>

Grounds for objection	Comment
<p>The building does not have any special association with the life or work a person that was important in the history of Barwon Heads.</p>	<p>that local significance does not preclude altered buildings.</p> <p>9 Bridge road is associated with two persons of interest; WC Thomas and A.J Derrick.</p> <p>The Thomas family have a long association with Barwon Heads being early settlers in the township, purchasing 9 Bridge Road in 1901. William Charles Thomas (miller, Murtoa) was the founder of W C Thomas & Sons, a prominent and successful flour milling company in Victoria. The connection with Barwon Heads for the family holidays is a longstanding one, spanning 90 years.</p> <p>In 1870 William Charles Thomas established a flour mill at Murtoa. The operation was expanded in the 1920s and the old mill was replaced by a brick mill in 1924-5 (Adler, 1997:49). It eventually closed in 1977.</p> <p>Thomas rapidly expanded his mill including the installation of what was said to be the first grain elevator in the country and by the 1880s they had seen off their competition. The Thomas' continued to expand their business in the early twentieth century, shifting their operations to Melbourne and also acquiring a rival firm from Ballarat, which had been their greatest competitor in the Wimmera (Context, 2012:49)</p> <p>A.J. Derrick (1862-1931) worked with architect Joseph Watts in Geelong before starting his own practice, undertaking a large number of commissions from 1880s to 1900. In 1893 he left architecture to establish in the Wesley Central Mission. His carpenter Gothic timber churches at Ocean Grove, Barwon Head, Wallington remain as examples of his work on the Bellarine Peninsula. His church at Drysdale is of brick and is highly embellished.</p>  <p>Ocean Grove Uniting Church, 1888, A.J.Derrick Source: Bellarine Historical Society</p>  <p>Barwon Heads Uniting Church, 1891, A.J.Derrick Source: Google Maps</p>

Grounds for objection	Comment
	 <p>Wallington Uniting Church, 1888, A.J.Derrick Source: Google Maps</p>  <p>Drysdale Uniting Church, 1887, A.J.Derrick Source: http://drysdale.unitingchurch.org.au/</p>
<p>The cypress tree is a very poor specimen, bifurcated, senescent and does not form part of the heritage landscape of this area. Furthermore, council has failed to obtain an arborist's report confirming the health and safety of the tree.</p>	 <p>The heritage significance of the tree is connected with the house, being planted in the 1940s. This is at a time when cypress trees were a common street tree in Hitchcock Avenue and Bridge Road. The tree is a link with these plantings and a focal point at the end of Hitchcock Avenue. It provides a setting to the house and is therefor included as part of its significance. Tree controls are therefore recommended.</p> <p>It is generally the owner's responsibility to provide an arborist report on the health and longevity of a tree if removal or trimming is required.</p>

Grounds for objection	Comment
Cypress tree a poor specimen and a risk to health and safety of occupants and visitors to the subject property.	The health of this tree is outside the scope of my expertise and is not relevant to heritage significance.
The amendment is being proposed for an ulterior motive in an attempt to thwart the redevelopment of the property generally in accordance with the planning scheme.	This is not relevant to the consideration of heritage significance.

4.0 CONCLUSION

In preparing this statement of evidence I have reviewed the RBA and Context Reports, the Amendment material, relevant background documents and the submissions. I have also inspected the site and surrounds of 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads and other places on the Heritage Overlay, particularly those places most like 9 Bridge Road.

I provide my opinion that the Amendment addresses the VPP Practice Note: *Applying the Heritage Overlay* in the following manner:

- The assessment of cultural heritage has been carried out according to the guidelines for preparing heritage assessments and using the accepted policy frameworks
- 9 Bridge Road has been found to be of local heritage significance to the City of Greater Geelong for its historic, representative and aesthetic values
- That tree controls have been appropriately applied to the site
- That the objecting submission received for Amendment C354 does not provide convincing evidence that 9 Bridge Road is not of cultural heritage significance

In other matters I have considered the concepts of integrity, intactness and condition as they apply to 9 Bridge Road and other places in Barwon Heads and I find that:

- The integrity of 9 Bridge Road is sufficient to understand and appreciate its heritage values and not sufficiently devalued by changes to its fabric
- When compared with other places on the Heritage Overlay there are several places exhibiting a similar level of integrity

I provide an opinion that the City of Greater Geelong has prepared this Amendment C354 in the proper manner, consistent with current heritage practice.

REFERENCES

- Authentic Heritage Services, 2000, *City of Greater Geelong Outer Areas Heritage Study Stage 2*, vols 2 & 4.
- The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance* (2013)
- City of Greater Geelong, Amendment C354 Council Delegate's Report.
- Context, 2012, Yarriambiack Shire Heritage Study Stage 1, Vol.1 Thematic Environmental History
- Context Pty Ltd, 2016 *Heritage Report, 9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads*, prepared for the City of Greater Geelong
- DTPLI, 2004, Review of Criteria and Thresholds for Places on the Heritage Overlay, Discussion Paper
- Planning Panels Victoria Guide to Expert Evidence
- Planning Practice Note 1, 2015, Applying the Heritage Overlay
- RBA Architects and Conservation Consultants, 2016, *9 Bridge Road Barwon Heads Heritage Values Review* prepared for the Barwon Heads Association
- Victorian Heritage Council, 2014, The Victorian Heritage Register Criteria and Threshold Guidelines

APPENDIX 1

Draft statement of significance

Included in the Context Report

What is significant?

The house and cypress tree (*Cupressus Macrocarpa*) at 9 Bridge Road, Barwon Heads comprising a late Victorian cottage built c.1890, and including the modifications made to the place up until c1930s is significant. Significant elements include the single storey gabled roof forms clad in corrugated sheet metal roofing, rendered chimneys, timber bargeboards with timber vertically-slatted gable infill and timber finials, timber weatherboard wall cladding, verandah, mature cypress tree. The siting and substantial setback of the house and the open front garden are also significant aspects of the place.

How is it significant?

The house and cypress tree at 9 Bridge Road, Barwon Heads is of local historic, architectural and aesthetic significance to the City of Greater Geelong.

Why is it significant?

9 Bridge Road is historically significant as a result of its early date of construction (c1890) and its association with the initial development of the township of Barwon Heads. It is one of a relatively small group of nineteenth century timber houses and public buildings that have survived to enable interpretation of the first settlement in the township. This historic significance is embodied in the late Victorian design elements of the house.

9 Bridge Road is historically significant for its association with prolific Geelong architect A J Derrick who is credited with the design of the house; but also a prominent member of Wesley Church Geelong and the architect of Wesleyan churches in Barwon Heads, Wallington, Ocean Grove and Drysdale. Derrick's successful practice in Geelong contributed the largest number of buildings in the area during 1860 – 1900. Derrick's later career as founding secretary of the Central Methodist Mission at Wesley Church, Melbourne resulted in his life being memorialised in a stained glass window at Wesley Church Yarra Street Geelong. (Criterion A)

9 Bridge Road is historically significant for its long association with the Thomas family who owned the property from 1901 to 1992 and used it for holiday purposes. The historical significance of the house is therefore also embodied in the early 20th century changes made to the house under the custodianship of the Thomas family. William Charles Thomas was the founder of W C Thomas & Sons, a successful and highly regarded milling company with mills in Murtoa, Beaufort, Ballarat, Newport and throughout the Wimmera and Mallee in Victoria. W C Thomas and Sons were significant exporters to the UK, South Africa and various Asian countries. W.C.Thomas was an important figure as an early adopter of the eight-hour day in the milling industry, a Councilor and later President of the Shire of Ripon and a lay preacher of the Methodist Church. (Criterion H)

The cypress tree (the remaining one of a pair planted in c1930s) is historically significant as part of the landscape of the early twentieth century phase of the house under the proprietorship of Thomas family. (Criterion A)

Early photographs in the possession of the Thomas family are significant as an associated collection and have the potential to further illuminate aspects of the property's evolution. (Criterion C)

As a late Victorian dwelling, the single story house at 9 Bridge Road is architecturally significant in demonstrating the surviving design qualities from 1891, together with the changes made to the place in c.1930. The house is a representative example of late Victorian architecture in Barwon Heads, a style characterised by the architectural form of main traversing gable roof and intersecting gabled wing decorated with timber slats and finial, horizontal

weatherboard cladding, corrugated iron roof cladding and a cement rendered chimney with terracotta pots. The early nineteenth century changes made to the place by the Thomas family, including the addition of the gabled wing and front verandah (subsequently enclosed), are representative of the types of modifications made to coastal holiday retreats. (Criterion D)

9 Bridge Road and the cypress tree (*Cupressus Macrocarpa*), are aesthetically significant for their prominent raised siting and landmark qualities at the end of Hitchcock Avenue. The house is aesthetically significant as part of the work of Geelong based architect A J Derrick whose modest Carpenter Gothic churches at Wallington, Ocean Grove, Barwon Heads and Drysdale are connected stylistically to the architecture of 9 Bridge Road.

Whilst having undergone extensions and alterations from the 1930s to the 1990s, the house still retains its late Victorian gable roofed form, decorative gable ends and its symmetrical composition as a result of alterations carried out in the 1930s. When compared with other nineteenth century houses surviving in Barwon Heads (and on the HO), 9 Bridge Road is comparable in terms of its integrity given that such changes to beach houses were commonplace and exhibited by almost all other examples of nineteenth century houses. (Criterion E)